

Denbighshire County Council and The Diocese of St.Asaph Objections Report
 Objections to the Proposal to Close Ysgol Llanfair DC and Ysgol Pentrecelyn and to establish a new area school

Under Section 49 of the School Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013 proposers must publish a summary of the statutory objections and the proposer's response to those objections ("the Objections Report")

Number of objections received: 30

	Point Raised	Local Authority and Diocese of St.Asaph Response	Number of Written Responses Raising the Point	% of Respondents Raising the Point
1	Proposal goes against the main targets outlined in the Welsh Government's 'Welsh Medium Education Strategy'- to safeguard and strengthen Welsh medium provision.	<p>Denbighshire County Council believes that the current Category 2 model at Ysgol Llanfair brings more pupils into Welsh education, who may have gone to an English medium school otherwise. The school attracts pupils from English speaking families whose children often start in the English medium stream and subsequently become confident enough in the Welsh language to move into the Welsh stream. Those pupils in the Welsh stream at Ysgol Llanfair are receiving a equivalent provision to those who attend a Category 1 Welsh medium provision. This proposal is part of the Ruthin Review, which started in 2012. A number of issues in the Ruthin area needed to be reviewed; the sustainability of schools, ensuring high quality provision, reducing the amount of surplus places, condition of the school buildings, recruitment of head teachers and demand for Welsh medium education.</p> <p>At the commencement of the Ruthin Review 28.8% of the capacity for the area was provided in Category 1 schools. We have a number of proposals in terms of the Ruthin area, these are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) Amalgamation of Ysgol Cyffylliog and Ysgol Clocaenog as Ysgol Carreg Emlyn (implemented September 2014), ii) Ysgol Rhewl- to close, 	5	17%

		<p>iii) Ysgol Llanbedr- to close and</p> <p>iv) Ysgol Llanfair and Ysgol Pentrecelyn amalgamated to form a new area school.</p> <p>These proposals for the overall Ruthin area reflect the need to reduce overall capacity in the area, whilst maintaining the current mixture of provision, albeit from a lower number of schools. The proposals provide a balance of choice of language, faith, town and rural schools. Should all the proposals as listed be adopted, there will be an increase in capacity for Welsh medium schools (Category 1) of approximately 17 places (34.4% of all places in the Ruthin area) and a reduction in the capacity of Dual stream schools (Category 2) of 97 places in the Ruthin area.</p> <p>At the commencement of the Ruthin Review in February 2013 24.89% of the capacity for the Ruthin area were faith places. If all proposals are adopted this will increase to 26.8% of all places in the Ruthin area, although a reduction of 20 faith places.</p>		
2	Proposal goes against Denbighshire County Council's Welsh in Education Strategic Plan 2014-2017. How can the Council be truly committed to this plan if they are closing a Category 1 Welsh medium school? We must challenge and question how re-categorising Ysgol Pentrecelyn to be a Category 2 school can ensure this?	<p>The outcomes of pupils wanting a Welsh medium education are equal in Category 1 and Category 2. The 2 categories in terms of Welsh medium provision are the same, but the way they are delivered may differ. The key will be how do we maintain and sustain the provision in a new model.</p> <p>Denbighshire County Council's Welsh in Education Strategic Plan 2014-2017 states that the Council is "fully committed to the Welsh Governments aspiration of delivering a 'sustained increase in both the number and percentage of people able to speak Welsh. The Council recognises the importance of bilingualism in 21st Century Wales and has adopted a long term aspiration that all children and young people in the County will leave full-time education being competent and confident in using both Welsh and English languages."</p>	6	20%
3	Schools should be grouped together based on identity- community, faith, Welsh medium, bilingual. Ysgol Pentrecelyn and Ysgol Llanfair should not be together as they differ in terms of religious identity and language category.	As a Local Authority we look at a geographical area and the communities that live in the area which the school/s serve.	1	3%

4	<p>There is a difference between Category 1 and Category 2 schools, even though in terms of educational attainment they are equal in terms of their requirements.</p> <p>There is more to Welsh medium education than pupil attainment only- ethos, management, administrative and social language equally important.</p> <p>Welsh medium schools offers a comprehensive experience of Wales' culture e.g. Eisteddfod, acting, singing, competing.</p> <p>There is no way of guaranteeing the same linguistic standard, undoubtedly the Welsh language will be weakened.</p>	<p>For a school to operate as a Category 2 school they need to be able to deliver Category 1 outcomes and ensure that the ethos is delivered in both languages. The importance of the Welsh language and ethos will ultimately be the responsibility of the schools Governing Body, they will need to ensure that the Welsh offer at the school does not weaken.</p> <p>Initially not much would change whilst the school remains on 2 sites. Should the proposal be adopted and a new school is built on one site it is difficult to say what the offer would look like entirely, nothing is predetermined.</p> <p>It is important that we do not lose sight of the categorisations and the 3 criteria- Curriculum, Language of the school and the Outcomes.</p> <p>Category 1 primary schools are 'Welsh – medium primary schools'- the curriculum delivery language is Welsh, as is the day to day communication language with the pupils. Pupil assessments are also undertaken through the medium of Welsh and the expectation is that pupils are able to easily transfer to Welsh medium secondary provision at the end of Key Stage 2. Pupils will also have reached a standard in English equivalent to pupils in predominantly English medium schools.</p> <p>Category 2 primary schools are dual stream primary schools- these schools provide Welsh medium and English medium provision side by side. Dependent upon parental choice the curriculum is delivered through the medium of Welsh or English. If they choose Welsh medium the delivery language of the pupil's education, the language of communication with the pupil and educational assessments is Welsh- the same as for a Category 1 school. If the parents choose for their child to be educated through the medium of English, the curriculum is delivered in English, the communication language with the child is English and any assessments are done in English- the same as a Category 5 school.</p> <p>The expectation for Category 2 schools is that pupils in the Welsh medium stream would be able to transfer to Welsh medium secondary provision, the same as Category 1 school pupils, with the pupils in the English stream being able to transfer to English medium secondary provision, the same as pupils from Category 5 primary schools.</p>	12	40%
5	<p>As 100% of pupils at Ysgol Pentrecelyn and 70% of the pupils at Ysgol Llanfair currently receive their education through the medium of Welsh,</p>	<p>It is important to remember that not all pupils at Ysgol Llanfair start in the Welsh stream, the way Ysgol Llanfair deliver Category 2 outcomes is very successful. Figures from February 2015 showed that of the 103 pupils; 76 pupils (73.8%)</p>	7	23%

	the case for Category 1 school is very strong.	were in the Welsh stream and 27 pupils (26.2%) in the English stream. 18 (17.5%) of the 76 pupils in the Welsh stream started off in the English stream.		
6	<p>Currently the bilingual education in Ysgol Llanfair is working very well, however there is no guarantee that this level of success can be sustained in the future- staff and governors are only temporarily- i.e. only in control of the school for their term in office/ post.</p> <p>Lack of commitment for the Welsh language can put Welsh at Category 2 schools in a volatile and inferior situation.</p> <p>Category 1 schools are unique- they provide Welsh education in fullness.</p>	<p>If the current proposal is adopted the Temporary Governing Body will be made up of governors from both schools, which will ensure the existing Welsh ethos would be carried forward into the new Area school.</p> <p>It will be the responsibility of the head teacher and Temporary Governing Body to ensure that the Welsh ethos is not reduced in any way, that all staff can speak Welsh- this can be incorporated into the school's recruitment policy. The Temporary Governing Body and then the permanent Governing Body have an important role to play in ensuring the new Category 2 school delivers the outcomes of a Category 2 school.</p> <p>The new school staff will be initially recruited from the 2 existing schools- posts will be 'ring fenced' for these staff. This will ensure that a strong Welsh ethos will remain. The instrument of governance must reflect the offer of the school.</p>	11	37%
7	The Governing body of a Voluntary Aided/ Voluntary Controlled School rather than the Local Authority have the right to apply for change of school language category.	<p>Any future change to the language category, of any school, would be required to be the subject of formal consultation and a statutory notice.</p> <p>A Governing Body cannot undertake a change in language category by itself, it must publish proposals to make any regulated alternations to a school and go through the consultation process, which includes consultation with the Local Authority and other stakeholders prior to a Statutory Notice period.</p> <p>If the proposal did not meet the Council's Strategy for Welsh Medium Education then we, as a Local Authority, would object. If there are any objections to the proposal then the Local Authority and not the Governing Body would decide if it should proceed.</p> <p>If the Local Authority itself objects then the proposal would be decided by the Welsh Minister.</p>	4	13%
8	<p>Contrary to other authorities in Wales- Denbighshire believes that the most effective way of increasing the number of fluent Welsh speakers is through volatile bilingual and not Welsh medium structures.</p> <p>Where is the evidence that a category 2 school enables more children to receive a Welsh medium education where other counties are</p>	<p>The Council's Welsh in Education Strategic Plan documents how the Council has planned to increase the number of pupils assessed through the medium of Welsh. This has been achieved by reviewing demand for Welsh Medium education to ensure sustainable long term provision. This approach has also been assisted by significant investment by Denbighshire County Council and the Welsh Government into Welsh medium primary schools.</p> <p>In reviewing the evidence in terms of parental demand, in this particular area, the Council is of the view that a Category 2 school would enable more children to</p>	3	10%

	moving away from Category 2 schools and developing Category 1 schools?	receive a Welsh medium education.										
9	Believe the new area school for Llanfair DC and Pentrecelyn should be a Category 1 school. Closing a Welsh medium school would be a major backward step for the area. You are not offering comparable education without having to travel outside this Welsh rural community.	It is unfortunate that the categorisation are numerical and there is an assumption that 1 is better than 2. The Local Authority believe that a Category 2 school meets the needs of the Llanfair/ Pentrecelyn area- the designation of the new school as a Category 2 is deemed appropriate as it meets the offer currently provided by both schools. The proposal has been put forward as the best solution for delivering education in the Llanfair DC and Pentrecelyn area as it delivers a school within the community, which would provide education to pupils in their parents' choice of language.	19	63%								
10	As the majority of pupils at Ysgol Pentrecelyn do not intend to enrol at the proposed school, this proposal is no longer viable. The known demand amongst parents shows that there is an increase in the demand for Welsh language education- Category 1 in the Pentrecelyn catchment area.	The Council is of the view that a primary school in the region of 105-140 pupils is sustainable within a rural location. Should the proposal be implemented, during the feasibility stage of the second phase, the Council may have to review elements of the plan such as the size of the new school. However, the Cabinet members are committed to delivering a new school for the area to ensure the future of education is secure, in terms of the standard of education and to provide facilities and resources that meet the needs of 21st Century education. The current situation is not sustainable. The Councils forecast of full-time pupil rolls for Ysgol Pentrecelyn suggests a small increase in pupil numbers over the next few years: <table border="1" data-bbox="1010 962 1688 1035"> <thead> <tr> <th>2016</th> <th>2017</th> <th>2018</th> <th>2019</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>40</td> <td>40</td> <td>42</td> <td>41</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> The capacity of the school has been calculated at 56 pupils, which taking the figures above into account, results in approximately 25% of surplus places within the school. The Council believes that this proposal offers parents the opportunity to maintain Welsh medium provision. The Council needs to reduce the number of places and schools in the area and this proposal will assist this.	2016	2017	2018	2019	40	40	42	41	3	10%
2016	2017	2018	2019									
40	40	42	41									
11	The current model in Ysgol Llanfair basically operates as a Category 1 school in all but name.	The outcomes at Ysgol Llanfair in Welsh first language are very good and we believe the model at Ysgol Llanfair attracts pupils from English speaking families who may have otherwise gone to an English medium school. In 2014 the	2	7%								

		<p>percentage achieving Level 4+ at Key Stage 2 in Welsh 1st language at Ysgol Llanfair DC was 90.9%, which was above the Denbighshire (85.1%) and national (88.1%) averages.</p> <p>The Governing Body at Ysgol Llanfair DC have been approached a number of times with requests to change the categorisation from a 2 to a 1, but this had been turned down each time as it was felt the school would lose pupils.</p> <p>The school's aim is to ensure that they have the highest possible numbers of Welsh speakers at the age of 11, therefore the Category 2 model works well for them. The Governing Body believe that being a Category 2 school has contributed to community cohesion, produced more Welsh speakers and facilitated pupils from non-Welsh speaking backgrounds to transfer over to Welsh medium education if they wished to, even though they had not intended to enter the stream at the beginning of their educational journey.</p> <p>'Dual- Stream' is the wording used by the Welsh Government to describe a Category 2 school, how this is delivered is down to the schools themselves- the way Ysgol Llanfair currently deliver Category 2 outcomes is something we wish to replicate in the new school- where both streams are in the same class, thereby immersing all pupils in the Welsh language.</p> <p>During the consultation period we received a number of responses from parents who sent their child to Ysgol Llanfair initially to the English stream, who then transferred to the Welsh stream. These parents stated that had the school been Category 1 then they would have sent them to an English medium school and therefore the Welsh language would have lost those pupils.</p>		
12	Concerns over how other Category 2 schools have operated.	<p>Unfortunately in the past monitoring of the categorisations has not been as stringent but, moving forward as a Local Authority, we are committed in ensuring a school's categorisation matches what it is delivering and its outcomes. We would ensure that safeguards are put in place around the Governing Body to ensure that the school is delivering to its category, such as ensuring the schools recruitment policy states that all posts must be Welsh essential and that the instrument of governance reflects the offer of the school.</p> <p>The Local Authority as part of its overall monitoring role for the Welsh Education Strategic Plan will ensure that the current strong Welsh medium ethos in both schools is retained and will intervene as appropriate should this be diluted.</p>	2	7%
13	The Council has failed in its duty to offer services	At both parents meetings a Welsh speaking officer was available to translate for	2	7%

	in the Welsh language on a number of occasions during the consultation process. Disappointed that at the consultation meetings we did not have the opportunity to put our views in Welsh.	anyone wishing to speak Welsh. Some people did not want to converse through a translator and therefore a follow up meeting was arranged with Welsh speaking officers the following week. All documentation was available in Welsh and English and all residents were able to respond in either language.		
14	The Llanellidan Community Council did not receive the consultation documents from the council.	In total 4 community/ town councils were emailed the formal consultation documents including the clerk for Llanellidan Community Council.	1	3%
15	On figures collected locally Ysgol Pentrecelyn full-time pupil numbers will raise to 44 next year, 45 in 2016/17 and 52 in 2017/18, would this make the new school oversubscribed?	We have to use the figures that are based on the PLASC (Pupil Level Annual School Census) and our projections. The size of the new school is not set in stone, however we need to be mindful that we do not build the school too big as this may have a negative effect on neighbouring schools.	1	3%
16	How does the Local Authority propose to safeguard the Welsh language provision in cases of oversubscription, would there be preference to those selecting the Welsh stream (point 3 in section 1.9 of DCC's admissions policy)? Who gets priority? Is the Council prepared to safeguard the balance between Welsh medium and English medium in the new area school?	The School Admissions Code (2013), page 12 section 2.29 states, "In setting oversubscription criteria admission authorities must not: Adopt criteria which select pupils on the basis of ability or aptitude (except in relation to school sixth forms) except schools with partially selective arrangements which already had such arrangements in place at the beginning of the 1997/98 school year and are permitted to continue to use selection by ability. There is only one school in Wales with partially selective arrangements. The general prohibition on ability based criteria includes, in the case of Welsh medium schools, the ability to speak Welsh." This would also apply to two-language schools. In terms of language criteria the exception is when defining the nearest "suitable" school, which is defined as being in accordance with the applicant's faith and language preference(s). The use of "suitable" in this context prevents us from giving priority to either language as they need to be considered equally. An option could be to determine separate admission numbers for the Welsh and English streams but this would need to be discussed with the schools Governing Body, the Local Authority and the Diocese of St.Asaph.	2	7%
17	It is difficult to compare 2 Estyn reports as they were completed 4 years apart.	We have to comply with the Welsh Government's School Organisation Code, which states that reference must be made to the latest Estyn reports of any schools being discussed.	1	3%
18	Category 2 school is not an equivalent choice for	The new area school will provide the option of Welsh medium education within	7	23%

	parents seeking Welsh medium education. Parents will be forced out of the area to a town school or another village school, 100% of our pupils are attending their nearest suitable school.	the Category 2- dual stream setting. The Council categorises its education provision in line with the Welsh Government's document Defining Schools according to Welsh medium provision October 2007. It does not help that the categorisation is numerical and that some people read that Category 2 is a lesser category than Category 1. In terms of Welsh language education they are the same but just delivered differently. We want to increase the number of non-Welsh speaking children accessing Welsh medium education and we believe Category 2 can do this. We also want to increase the number of children becoming proficient in the Welsh language. It is important to recognise that pupils at Ysgol Llanfair in the English stream have very good Welsh second language skills as well.		
19	The Council will have no Category 1 schools between Ruthin and Llangollen.	Point noted.	2	7%
20	Other options that need examining are: - Federating with other rural Category 1 schools- Carreg Emlyn and Gwyddelwern with 1 managing head.	A federation involving 4 schools (Ysgol Bro Elwern is already federated with Ysgol Betws Gwerfil Goch) over a wide geographical area could place pressure on the leadership of the school. This option would not address issues regarding surplus places.	2	7%
21	Federating with Ysgol Pen Barras.	This option would not address issues such as surplus places and condition of the school.	2	7%
22	New area school being a Category 1 community or VC school and pupils seeking English medium (and faith based) education transferring to Ysgol Borthyn, Ysgol Llanbedr or Rhos street.	We believe that the proposal of a Category 2 school meets the needs of the area that the school will serve.	2	7%
23	Two schools, one site with an executive head managing the 2 schools.	Moving both schools in their current form to a shared new site with one executive head may not be viable or sustainable. The new executive head would have two line managers in the form of two governing bodies and would have to duplicate all the administrative functions of a school. This option would create equivalent small and medium sized Welsh medium provision next to each other which is not sustainable. Economies of scale would not be realised in constructing the new site due to the need to create two separate schools on the same site. This would add cost to the project such as creating two secure entrances, two staff rooms, two halls etc. Other mergers that the Local Authority have undertaken in the county have been	1	3%

		successful, such as Ysgol Carreg Emlyn and Ysgol Bro Dyfrdwy .		
24	One school, 2 defined and separate streams- English and Welsh- immersion would still be there for those pupils from non-Welsh speaking families in the Welsh stream.	If the current proposal is adopted, it will be the responsibility of the head teacher and Temporary Governing Body to decide on the classroom configuration for the new school. We as promoters believe that the way Ysgol Llanfair currently delivers within the Category 2 category, delivers the best outcomes for Welsh and non-Welsh speakers.	1	3%
25	Has the site at Pentrecelyn been considered?	Feasibility work on a possible site for the new school has started. Part of this work will be to look at both current school sites.	1	3%
26	Governing body will need a strong Welsh ethos and policies which have the Welsh language at the heart of the school- how can the Governing Body influence parent choice and retain a Welsh majority to allow immersion to continue in future years?	It will be up to the Governing Body to shape the ethos and culture of the school to ensure it is attractive to parents who seek Welsh medium education for their child, whether they are fluent Welsh speakers or learners. The school via induction events would be able to reinforce this ethos upon prospective parents in terms of how their children would be educated within the new school.	1	3%
27	According to the Community and Welsh Language Impact Assessment the proposal would be neutral in regards to the Welsh language. We have concerns over this. The Positive/ Neutral/ Negative table in the assessment does not reflect the reality.	The document aims to be subjective in terms of the impact that the proposal would have upon the wider Llanfair/ Pentrecelyn community. It will be important for the new school to ensure that a Welsh ethos is retained. Whilst we have acknowledged that the use of Welsh may reduce outside the classroom it is important to recognise that the Governing Body can ensure that the recruitment policy can state that all staff must be Welsh speaking, which will ensure the Welsh language remains a strong presence in the school. The current proposal contained in the consultation document is to establish an Area school on 2 sites, therefore the Community and Welsh language Impact Assessment was focused on this only. The School Organisation Code states that in terms of the Community and Welsh language impact assessments “the requirement for assessments should not be overly burdensome and does not consider that it is necessary to commission such work from external consultants.”	2	7%
28	Does bilingualism work better through immersion in a Category 1 school or a Category 2 school? It would be better to use a Category 1 school as the basis for true immersion and where the Welsh language is used in all aspects of school life.	The current evidence suggests that the current model of Ysgol Llanfair delivers strong education outcomes for pupils education through the medium of Welsh. Over the last 3 years the school in terms of outcomes for Welsh 1 st language in Key Stage 2 at level 4, has seen Ysgol Llanfair outperform the Denbighshire and all Wales average. Therefore from the evidence we believe that the outcomes at Ysgol Llanfair are	3	10%

	Category 1 schools accommodate children from non-Welsh speaking families as well. Immersion education also means that as well as the language medium of lessons, Welsh is used for activities across the whole school, extra-curricular activities and the language informally used by children with each other on the yard.	very good and that the way they deliver Category 2 outcomes is very successful.		
29	In a Category 2 school pupils are assessed in Welsh first language and Welsh second language with some pupils transferring to the bilingual 'N' stream in Brynhyfryd- if this ceases to exist how would the pupils studying Welsh as a second language continue their education?	<p>Pupils in both the English and 'N' streams at Ysgol Brynhyfryd have to study Welsh as a 2nd language.</p> <p>Presently the 'N' stream in Brynhyfryd is considered suitable for pupils who have learnt Welsh as a second language and who, by the end of Key Stage 2, have a good understanding of the language. These are usually pupils transferring from Category 2 primary schools. The 'N' stream is for Welsh learners; it is not bilingual provision.</p> <p>Pupils' competency and confidence in the Welsh language is assessed at the end of key stage 2 and advice provided on the most appropriate provision in terms of ensuring linguistic progression.</p> <p>From September 2015, the 'N' stream is stopping in its present form. Pupils who are already in the 'N' stream will receive additional support so that they can successfully enter the Welsh 1st language stream and will be assessed as 1st language at the end of Key stage 3 and GCSE. There maybe a few pupils who do not make the expected progress or because of parental preference will transfer to the English stream.</p>	2	7%
30	The Council does not use catchment areas when determining school admissions- should this be reconsidered?	The current arrangements allow for diversity of choice regarding faith, language and location, which are often difficult to determine with strictly defined catchment areas.	1	3%
31	Headteacher in a Category 2 school could be a non-Welsh speaker in addition to some members of staff.	Should the current proposal be adopted the Temporary Governing Body of the new school will initially be made up of Ysgol Llanfair DC governors, Ysgol Pentrecelyn governors and foundation Governors appointed by the Diocese of St.Asaph. It will be there responsibility to appoint a suitable Welsh speaking head teacher. The Temporary Governing Body will have a responsibility to ensure that Welsh is not reduced in any way and that all staff can speak Welsh- this can be incorporated into the school's recruitment policies. This is no different to a Category 1 school. If there was any pressure for the language category to change	2	7%

		there are safeguards in place to protect it. The Governing Body have an important role to play in ensuring a Category 2 school delivers the outcomes of a Category 2 school.		
32	Future of the "Cylch Ti a Fi" at Pentrecelyn- currently 12 children attend.	During the first phase when the school is on the 2 existing sites, nothing will change and the Ti a Fi could continue. Prior to the establishment of a single site school, we would work with providers to ascertain best service delivery for these services.	1	3%
33	Ysgol Llanfair works well currently due to the low class sizes and the fact that classes are run as one rather than 2 streams, therefore pupils choosing the English stream are immersed in Welsh- this cannot be sustained in the new school where pupil numbers will be bigger.	The learning offer and structure of the proposed new school will be the responsibility of the headteacher and the Temporary Governing Body. They will decide how it will be configured in order to deliver what is required. We, as a Local Authority, can advise and support to ensure that the offer is right to deliver dual stream. It would be premature to say now how the class sizes will be configured, but there are a number of options available to preserve and enhance the provision. When the school is on the 2 existing sites we would advise the Temporary Governing Body to keep things as they are. It will also be about working in partnership with GwE and working with the Temporary Governing Body to look at what is needed and what the budget will allow. It is important to understand that there is a commitment from the Local Authority for this to work.	2	7%
34	There is now no Ti a Fi in Pwllglas- what influence will this have on the future linguistic balance in a school such as Ysgol Llanfair?	We believe that Ysgol Llanfair is attractive to Welsh speaking and non-Welsh speaking families. The ethos of the staff and school is distinctively Welsh. The delivery model of the curriculum allows for those pupils who start at the school in the English stream to move into the Welsh stream confidently and continue their education in the medium of Welsh in secondary school.	1	3%
35	The 2 schools are very similar- only difference is a minority of pupils did not take their foundation phase and Key stage 2 tests through the medium of Welsh. How do you secure this forever when a school is a constantly evolving entity? The answer is via opening a new welcoming rural Category 1 school marketed as promoting bilingualism.	The Council believes that the proposal offers parents the opportunity to maintain Welsh medium provision in the area. The Council needs to reduce the number of places and schools in the area and this proposal will assist this.	1	3%
36	Break-up of communities if some families decide to send their children to the area school whilst	At present as a wider community there are many activities outside of school where the children in the community come together to participate in activities.	3	10%

	others opt for an alternative Category 1 school.	We would hope that the majority, if not all pupils from Ysgol Pentrecelyn, would attend the new Area school, although the final decision regarding choice will be made by parents. However, this should not be seen as a barrier for the continued community interaction which presently takes place.		
37	Whilst there is a majority selecting the minority language it may work with the support of staff but how can the school implement a policy forcing limits on parental choice; is this possible? It would be better to use a Category 1 school as the basis for the immersion model.	It would be the responsibility of the head teacher and Temporary Governing Body to ensure that Welsh is not reduced in anyway and that all staff can speak Welsh. We believe that the Category 2 model, as demonstrated in Ysgol Llanfair now, delivers very good outcomes.	1	3%
38	Potential growth in housing in the area could have an influence on the language balance of the new school.	We cannot predict who will move into the area. There is also parental preference; therefore it is difficult to assess which mediums of education people will choose for their children in terms of language, faith, size and location.	2	7%
39	What has the Local Authority done in terms of Welsh medium education?	Denbighshire, in partnership with the Welsh Government, over the last 5 years have carried out extension works to increase capacity at a number of Welsh medium primary schools. These include; Ysgol Gymraeg y Gwernant, Llangollen, Ysgol Bro Dyfrdwy, Cynwyd, Ysgol y Llys, Prestatyn and Ysgol Twm o'r Nant, Denbigh. The proposals for the Ruthin area could also lead to investment in Ysgol Pen Barras and a new school site for Ysgol Carreg Emlyn, Clocaenog and Cyffylliog which is currently operational across the 2 sites. There is also £15.9m to be invested in secondary provision through the extension works at Ysgol Glan Clwyd, St.Asaph. The establishment of the Welsh in Education Strategic Group has assisted the authority in focusing on meeting the demand for Welsh medium education whether within a Category 1 or Category 2 setting.	1	3%
40	According to the 2011 census, 48.3% of residents of the ward can speak Welsh, amongst the highest in Denbighshire. If this isn't a basis to create a Category 1 school in one of the most Welsh areas in the County, then the whole logic of the existence of Category 1 schools in any part of the county must be questioned.	The ability to speak Welsh in the Llanfair/ Gwyddelwern ward is broken down as follows: Gwyddelwern 62.06%, Llanfair DC 49.71%, Llanelidan 45.89% and Bryneglwys 39.89%. Within this ward there are currently 3 primary schools: Ysgol Pentrecelyn- Category 1, Ysgol Bro Elwern- Category 1 Ysgol Llanfair DC- Category 2.	2	7%
41	The Local Authority aim is to increase the	The 28% target was achieved in 2012/13 with 285 seven year old pupils taught	2	7%

	<p>number of pupils receiving a Welsh medium education 28.1% (285) in 2012/13 to 29% in 2017.</p> <p>By 2015/16 28% had been achieved, 3 years earlier than planned. It seems strange that Denbighshire's boast to reach a 'challenging' target earlier than anticipated leads to setting a very small target of only 29% by 2016/17. One of the best ways of reaching this would be to ensure an area school in one of the most Welsh areas of the County of Welsh medium Category 1 status.</p>	<p>through the medium of Welsh. To increase the target further would require a significant change in demand from English medium to Welsh medium, especially in the north of the authority where the number of pupils is increasing.</p> <p>Between 2010/11 and 2011/12 the number of pupils increased by 10 but the percentage taught at seven years old fell by 1.8% due to growth in English medium schools. The authority has invested significantly in the last few years, increasing the number of places in the north of the county at Ysgol y Llys, Prestatyn and Ysgol Twm o'r Nant, Denbigh. This will support growth in Welsh medium in this area.</p> <p>There is a risk that establishing the area school as a Category 1 school could reduce demand for Welsh medium education within the area with parents opting for English medium education.</p>		
42	<p>Understand that the Council is in the process of creating a new Welsh Language Scheme for the county. Any decision to reclassify the school should be put on hold until this new scheme is adopted. There is no sense in agreeing one policy that affects the education in the county when another policy, that could affect education in the county, is prepared at the same time.</p>	<p>A new Welsh Language scheme for Denbighshire is in its infancy.</p> <p>This proposal is being presented in line with current policies and officers cannot pre-empt the contents/ outcomes of a new scheme which currently has no definite timetable of implementation.</p>	1	3%
43	<p>There is a thought that a Category 2 school is more attractive than a Category 1 school if parents are unsure about whether their child will cope with learning Welsh as a second language. The Council schools admissions policy clearly states that "The majority of Nursery, Reception and Year 1 pupils attending Welsh Medium or opting for Welsh at a dual stream school easily develop competence and confidence in both Welsh and English, regardless of the family home language."</p> <p>Ysgol Pentrecelyn, as a Welsh medium primary school have non-Welsh speaking families, we are not exclusive, we are a community.</p>	<p>We believe that the Category 2 model, as delivered in Ysgol Llanfair, attracts pupils from both Welsh and English speaking families. The Welsh stream in Ysgol Llanfair is equivalent to the provision in a Welsh medium Category 1 school.</p>	2	7%

	If the new school were to be a Category 2 it would isolate those parents seeking a Welsh Medium education via true immersion.			
44	There is a history of children switching from the English stream to the Welsh stream in Llanfair. If these children had not switched the language balance within the school would have been 56% Welsh stream, 44% English stream- a very different language balance.	We agree the language balance would have been different- as of February 2015 the split was 73.8% in the Welsh stream and 26.2% in the English stream. However, this reflects the success the school has of encouraging parents to choose the Welsh stream for their child, when initially they entered the school in the English stream.	1	3%
45	If bilingual schools work so well, why are there only 36 out of the 1333 primary schools in Wales?	Denbighshire County Council believes that the current Category 2 model at Ysgol Llanfair brings more pupils into Welsh education that may have gone to an English medium school otherwise. The school attracts pupils from English speaking families who may have gone to an English medium school otherwise. The outcomes of pupils wanting a Welsh medium education are equal in Category 1 and Category 2. The 2 categories in terms of Welsh medium provision are the same but the way they are delivered may differ. The situation regarding Welsh medium provision varies from county to county and the way some counties describe their schools varies- i.e. in Gwynedd they categorise all of their school as 'bilingual' and do not refer to the Welsh Government's categories. In Carmarthenshire they use the term 'bilingual education' Gareth Morgans, Chief Education Officer for Carmarthenshire has stated that "when we use the term 'Welsh- medium education' that, in my experience, attracts a lot of comment and also some opposition. When we talk about creating bilingual pupils, where both Welsh and English are first languages, in a way, there is far greater acceptance among the parents of that approach." (Quote taken from The Children, Young People and Education Committee, Welsh Government, 2nd July 2015.)	1	3%
46	Ysgol Llanfair DC is a unique model sustained by factors that can be changed, it cannot be preserved forever and is in fact closing, something that people seem to be forgetting. How can the new area school work in the same	The Temporary Governing Body will be made up of Governors from both schools which will ensure the existing Welsh ethos would be carried forward into the new Area school. It will be the responsibility of the head teacher and Temporary Governing Body to ensure that Welsh is not reduced in any way, that all staff can speak Welsh- this can be incorporated into the school's recruitment policies. The	2	7%

	way when it will be a bigger school starting with a new slate?	Governing Body has an important role to play in ensuring a Category 2 school delivers the outcomes of a Category 2 school.		
47	In a report published last year by Estyn "Linguistic progression and standards of Welsh in ten bilingual schools", it states that "Only in a third of bilingual schools do most pupils who study Welsh as a first language follow two or more additional GCSEs through the medium of Welsh. Overall, the proportion of pupils studying Welsh as a first language declines as they progress through their schooling." Whilst these quotes, in part, refer to secondary education the key point is the decrease of the number of pupils progressing the Welsh Medium education in the secondary sector.	The Estyn report looked at progression and standards in ten secondary schools. The report focused on the linguistic progression of pupils in key stage 4 in terms of studying Welsh as a first language and other qualifications through the medium of Welsh; evaluated the effectiveness of curricular models and teaching methods that are in place in bilingual schools; and identified and shared good practice in relation to bilingual education. It doesn't comment on primary age provision. Pupils who choose the Welsh medium stream in a Category 2 school have the same opportunities to go into Welsh medium secondary education as those who attend a Category 1 school. Based on current numbers at Ysgol Llanfair and Ysgol Pentrecelyn, 76% of pupils would be in the Welsh medium stream at the end of Key stage 2 of the new area school. This would deliver 96 pupils to secondary Welsh medium education based on the number of pupils at the school in September 2014.	1	3%
48	What does the Church have to offer the new school that is different to the ethos that is in most community schools already?	In terms of curriculum and admissions policy nothing would change. Community schools are required to promote "broadly Christian values"; as a voluntary controlled school it would have a "clearly" Christian ethos. The school would have 2 inspections- 1 from Estyn and 1 from the Church. The Church would have representation on the Governing Body and would give extra help and support to the school.	2	7%
49	Suggest the Current Proposal is amended to include the formation of a Language Centre based either on the premises of the new Area school or the current school house premises at Ysgol Pentrecelyn. The main purpose of the Centre would be to provide intense Welsh medium education to latecomers to the Welsh language at all rural Welsh schools in southern parts of Denbighshire. This would allay any fears of parents of junior age pupils currently in the English medium stream at Ysgol Llanfair and all other parents in	In Denbighshire, we have two latecomer centres; one is at Ysgol Bro Elwern, Gwyddelwern and the other at Ysgol y Llys, Prestatyn. The provision of Welsh language immersion centres will be considered separately to the current proposal. The current proposal provides a model, which currently is perceived by parents, to provide a smooth transition to access Welsh medium education.	1	3%

	similar circumstances in other local Welsh rural schools in South Denbighshire.			
50	Understand the financial reasons but this proposal will damage the language and its future.	<p>The model at Ysgol Llanfair currently increases the number of young people who speak the Welsh language. By encouraging English speaking families to send their child/ren to the school we are increasing the number of people using the language who could have been lost to English medium education. If we are going to safeguard the language we need to increase the effort to speak Welsh.</p> <p>The current situation is not sustainable.</p> <p>The Council is committed to providing a first class education for all children and young people in the county. We have to change and modernise education provision in the county, as improvements in education cannot be sustained without changes to the way education is provided. We believe this proposal is the best solution for delivering education in the Llanfair DC and Pentrecelyn areas.</p>	2	7%
51	For those seeking a Welsh medium education, only option is Ysgol Pen Barras- 9 miles from Llandegla.	The new area school will offer a Welsh medium education for those pupils who choose the Welsh stream.	1	3%
52	Are the wishes of Pentrecelyn school parents less important than the wishes of a minority of Llanfair school parents?	The designation of the new school as a Category 2 school was deemed appropriate as it would meet the offer currently provided by both Ysgol Pentrecelyn and Ysgol Llanfair DC. The current situation is not sustainable and we believe that this proposal is the best solution for delivering education in the Llanfair DC and Pentrecelyn areas.	1	3%
53	How is the County going to ensure enough spaces for the present pupils at Pentrecelyn to receive their education in a Category 1 school in future?	<p>The transfer numbers from Ysgol Pentrecelyn to the proposed new Area school is not yet known.</p> <p>Some may choose to attend Ysgol Bro Elwern, Gwyddelwern, if that is the nearest school to their home address. Others who want to attend a Category 1 school may choose to transfer to Ysgol Pen Barras, Ruthin.</p> <p>Figures from September 2014 show that there are 29 surplus places in Ysgol Pen Barras and 13 in Ysgol Bro Elwern, therefore a total of 42 places. The new development in Glasdir will also increase the capacity at Ysgol Pen Barras.</p> <p>We would hope that some Pentrecelyn parents would send their child to the new area school. Of the 30 parents who responded to the consultation document- 4 said they would go to the area school, 4- were unsure/ skipped the question, 9 said to another Category 1 school, 12 to Ysgol Pen Barras, 1 to Ysgol Bryn Tabor,</p>	2	7%

		1 to Ysgol Carreg Emlyn (1 parent responded twice)		
54	The process in making a final decision is entirely unjust. Astonished to find the Diocesan Board of Education will decide with the Cabinet on whether to proceed with the proposal. During the full consultation process the Board naturally gave full support to the proposal- they have a full vested interest in this matter as the county are proposing a faith school under the control of the Board itself.	In accordance with the School Organisation Code where a school is to be designated as a Voluntary Aided (VA) or Voluntary Controlled (VC) the associated Diocese become one of the promoters and will open the new area school, as the proposal is for the new Area school to be a Church in Wales Voluntary Controlled school. The Cabinet will meet separately from the Diocesan Board of Statutory Education to discuss the objections.	1	3%
55	Object to the fact that it will be a Church school- history tells us that the Welsh people in rural, agricultural and mainly Nonconformist areas such as Pentrecelyn suffered gravely at the hands of the Church.	We believe that faith-based education is an important part of the overall education portfolio on offer to parents in Denbighshire and we wish to maintain the provision currently offered by Ysgol Llanfair DC in this regard. There is no prejudice against non-faith or Welsh chapel children. Admissions criteria and the RE syllabus remain the same as is currently in place in both Ysgol Llanfair DC and Ysgol Pentrecelyn. We would welcome strong links with the local chapel, and would hope the proposed new school would foster a positive and fruitful relationship with the chapel minister as well as the local Church in Wales incumbent. The Church in Wales is open and transparent in its offer to parents that its ethos is based on a set of values that promotes Christian character and an education that is about values, as well as academic achievement. Its vision is for a school that will celebrate and promote the Welsh language and culture, and that will seek to give all its pupils a broad and rich education underlined with a Christian ethos.	1	3%
56	We love our language and are disgusted with some of the councillors who have turned their backs on the language and our Welsh community. In the Cabinet meeting on the 3rd June council members were keen for the 2 communities to turn against each other and that you were trying to blackmail us into doing things your way by saying the new school will be delayed or stopped if we took you to court.	The Council has been in discussions with both Governing Bodies regarding options for joint working to ensure sustainable provision in the Llanfair/ Pentrecelyn area for a number of months prior to the consultation period. This discussion included options for working together and moving towards a single site. During these meetings an overall consensus towards the area school model has been supported alongside the new school being designated as a Voluntary Controlled School recognised by the Church in Wales. Both schools have expressed support for retaining their existing language designation. If the proposal is delayed, this could have a detrimental effect on a new school	1	3%

		being built as the funding could be lost.		
57	Reducing the amount of Category 1 schools in the area will have a negative effect on our native language.	<p>The focus of Denbighshire is ensuring that we provide schools of the right type in the right place to meet parental demand. Accordingly the focus is on the number of places to access Welsh medium education rather than a cruder measure of the number of Category 1 schools.</p> <p>At the commencement of the Ruthin Review 28.8% of the capacity for the area was provided in Category 1 schools.</p> <p>We have a number of proposals in terms of the Ruthin area and these are;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) Ysgol Cyffylliog and Ysgol Clocaenog amalgamated as Ysgol Carreg Emlyn (implemented September 2014), ii) Ysgol Rhewl- to close, iii) Ysgol Llanbedr- to close and iv) Ysgol Llanfair and Ysgol Pentrecelyn amalgamated to form a new area school. <p>These proposals for the overall Ruthin area reflect the need to reduce overall capacity in the area whilst maintaining the current mixture of provision in the area, albeit from a lower number of schools. The proposals provide a balance of choice of language, faith, town and rural schools. Should all the proposals be adopted there will be an increase in capacity for Welsh medium Schools- Category 1 of approximately 17 places (34.4% of all places in the Ruthin area) and a reduction in the capacity of Dual stream schools- Category 2 of 97 places in the Ruthin area.</p> <p>At the commencement of the Ruthin Review in February 2013, 24.89% of the capacity for the Ruthin area were faith places. If all proposals are adopted this will increase to 26.8% of all places in the Ruthin area, although a reduction of 20 faith places.</p>	3	10%
58	<p>The consultation review undertaken by the Council to involve the community and public in any participation in the decision making process has been limited to say the least, with the council limiting the consultation process to one option only- the councils preferred option of closing the school.</p> <p>The evidence in favour of a new Category 1</p>	<p>The Formal consultation document, which was issued in February 2015, detailed a number of options that the Council had considered and the reasons why they had been discounted- in accordance with the School Organisation Code 2013. Section 2.1 looked at 6 options that had been looked at for the area and matched these to the Council's Investment Objectives and Critical Success Factors. From these one option was preferred and discussed in further detail in the document. All letters and emails received during the consultation period were available in full to all Cabinet Members. The Consultation Report, that summarised the</p>	6	20%

	school has not been presented.	responses, was circulated to all respondents who requested it as well as those we have to send it to in accordance with the School Organisation Code 2013. The Council's Cabinet carefully considered all the issues raised during the consultation period, on balance, in considering all the issues, Cabinet Members supported the proposal to provide a Category 2 Dual- stream school.		
59	The Council has not taken into account the facts which have arisen from the consultation process; that the majority of Ysgol Pentrecelyn respondents were against the closure of the school and opposed to a Category 2 dual stream school- these were disregarded as was the suggestion that Ysgol Pentrecelyn would consider a federation between other schools.	The Council's Cabinet carefully considered all the issues raised during the consultation period. On balance in considering all the issues, Cabinet Members supported the proposal to provide a Category 2 Dual- stream school. All original letters and emails were made available to all Cabinet members to view and a summary of all responses was published in the Consultation Report.	3	10%
60	It is unbelievable that the council are willing to sacrifice the loss of the Welsh language even after the major report commissioned by them into the Welsh language by Cefin Campbell. The report stated that: "Welsh will no longer be a living language in Denbighshire in 10 years unless drastic action is taken to save it!" The council spent a lot of money commissioning this report and on this occasion are going against its findings. Is this a proper way to spend the tax payers money- on reports that no one is going to take any notice of?	The recommendations of the Sbectrwm Consultancy Report (Author Cefin Campbell) have not yet been adopted by the Authority as policy. The report and recommendations will be subject to scrutiny from elected members and will require their support to be adopted as policy. Proposals must adhere to the current policies of the authority and cannot pre determine the adoption of a recommendation that has not been approved by the Council.	5	17%
61	The Council has failed to comply with requirements of the School Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013 and the School Organisation Code (2013). The consultation either relates to the Current Proposal and both the First and Second phase or the establishment of an Area school on the existing sites. The Council's preferred option is to close both schools and establish a new school on	The Council is of the view that the Consultation document meets the requirements of the School Organisation Code. The formal consultation document states in section 1.3 that: "Denbighshire County Council would close Ysgol Llanfair DC and Ysgol Pentrecelyn on the 31st August 2016; and the Church in Wales will establish a new Area School on the existing sites from 1st September 2016." This is reiterated in the Statutory Notice. This is the proposal that the consultation document is based upon. The reference to the second phase, namely providing a single site for the new school is included	2	7%

	<p>one site, none of the consultees can be clear whether they are being consulted on this preferred option, Second Phase or alternatively just the option of establishing a new school using the existing sites- First Phase.</p> <p>We consider that the First Phase of the consultation is predicted on the Second Phase being fulfilled. However, we, as consultees, are not provided with sufficient information in relation to the Second Phase in order to make an informed decision.</p> <p>This uncertainty is not assisted by the Community and Welsh Language Impact Assessment which relates only to the First Phase of the proposal.</p> <p>If the consultation includes the Second Phase- a fundamental error is that the document does not identify the location of the single site school, which must be provided.</p>	<p>in the consultation document for information to ensure parents and consultees are aware of the wider picture as to why the proposal has been brought forward. A counter argument could be made that by not including the Council's aspiration to provide a new school on a single site would be more likely to fall foul of the requirement in the Code to, "include sufficient reasons and information for particular proposals to enable intelligent consideration and responses."</p>		
62	<p>The Statutory Notice mentions the closure of both schools without specifying the background of their language categorisation and does not explain to the layman what exactly is a Category 1 or 2 school.</p> <p>The Notice does not specifically refer to the fact that parents can choose to send their children to a category one school and ensure free transport for pupils to attend a nearby Category one school.</p>	<p>The School Organisation Code 2013 does not state that the language category needs to be noted when discontinuing a school.</p> <p>The Statutory Notice for the proposal does state that further information regarding the proposal can be found on the Council's website and it names the Welsh Government document that details the language categorisations and the document number.</p> <p>The Explanatory note details where people can get hold of the consultation document, the Council's School Admissions Policy and Home to School Transport Policy, which provides this level of information.</p>	2	7%
63	<p>Why does the Church in Wales want to open a new Category 2 school and not a Category 1 school? How much influence does it have on the decision?</p>	<p>The Diocese of St.Asaph responded to the formal consultation stating, "We are aware that much debate has been held over the language categorisation of the new school. Having considered the different options, we believe that, in this case, the bilingual model is the best option for fostering and promoting the highest possible learner outcomes for Welsh Language. To this end, we support</p>	1	3%

		and endorse the statement made by the Governing Body of Ysgol Llanfair DC in response to this consultation. We take great pride in Ysgol Llanfair's outstanding promotion and support for Welsh Language and culture. All available school data supports our view that their model of bilingual learning actively encourages the uptake of Welsh-medium education, and is particularly helpful for parents seeking to fully engage with their children's learning."		
64	The County's transportation policy separates Ysgol Pentrecelyn pupils who want to go to other Category 1 schools.	Transport will be provided in accordance with the Council's current School Transport policy. Within the current policy, transport is provided from the pupils home address and in particular the policy states that " The Authority will provide discretionary transport to the nearest school providing Welsh medium education even if it is not their nearest qualifying school. For this purpose, it would be a school which is categorised as 1 or 2 within the Welsh Government guidelines on Welsh medium Provision."	2	7%
65	Make other English schools in the Ruthin area into Category 2 schools and open a new Category 1 area school for Welsh first language pupils and learners who wish to have Welsh medium education, as this is the wish of the majority in Llanfair and all of the pupils in Pentrecelyn.	The provision within the Llanfair/ Pentrecelyn areas and the wider Ruthin area is not considered to be sustainable, we need to reduce surplus places and the number of schools we have. Overall, the Ruthin Review proposals seek to increase Category 1 provision in terms of places and seek to provide the right offer in the right locations. The feedback from the majority of Llanfair parents suggests support for the current proposal.	1	3%
66	The Council decided Ysgol Carreg Emlyn was to be Category 1 with Ysgol Cyffylliog (Category 2) required to conform.	In considering any proposal the Council needs to consider the individual needs of the area to ensure that the right offer is made to meet the local demand, which fits into the overall demand for the wider area. The Council believes that applying a one size fits all approach would not work in Denbighshire. In considering this wider picture different solutions were proposed for Clocaenog/ Cyffylliog as opposed to the Llanfair/ Pentrecelyn proposal. The difference in that situation was that Ysgol Cyffylliog, which although classed as a Category 2 school offered little dual stream provision- it was mainly through the medium of Welsh. There was a very small cohort of pupils who had been assessed in English and second language Welsh over the last few years, however most pupils were assessed in Welsh. The balance overall was much greater for Welsh medium education in the area.	1	3%

		Ysgol Llanfair offers something distinctive.		
67	How can any school turn into a non-Welsh school in the end? Are you suggesting a Category 1 school can turn into a non-Welsh school at some point in in the future?	Yes, in theory this could happen. Any proposal that emerges reflects parental demand for places and in an instance where there is no or little demand for Welsh medium education then the Council would review, amongst all options the language category of a school and this could be reviewed to meet local demand.	1	3%
68	The local dialect which is unique to this small area will be diluted.	Point noted.	1	3%
69	It has been stated and published several times that Welsh medium education in a Category 2 school is just like Welsh medium education in a Category 1 school except delivered differently-how is it delivered differently this is not explained.	The Ysgol Llanfair DC model has both streams in the same class, and this is working very well. The configuration of the classes in the proposed new area school will be a decision for the Temporary Governing Body. The Local Authority would advise that whilst the school is on the 2 existing sites things could stay as they are.	1	3%